Identifying Association Rules Between Symptoms in VAERS

by Craig Paardekooper

We can investigate symptom clusters in VAERS by seeing how often symptom B occurs when symptom A occurs. When symptom B accompanies symptom A with a high degree of confidence, we call this an association rule.

Dataset

For each VAERs record there are 5 symptoms listed. I looked at 600,000 records for the year 2021 USA data. The file is too big to upload, but you can access 2021 data from the VAERS website or the Way-back Machine.

Method

I used a datamining technique called Association Rule Mining. It looked at every instance where symptom A occurred at le ast 1.5 in 10000 times, and then provided the probability (confidence) that symptom B would also occur. The minimum confidence level was set to 0.2

```
association_rules = apriori(baskets, min_support=0.00015, min_confidence=0.2, min_lift=3, min_length=2) association_results = list(association_rules)
```

Results

1. Association Rules:

Using this process I identified 1618 association rules. These can be viewed in a CSV file attached. https://howbad.info/sym-vaers.csv

Amongst these rules I found that -

40% of the reports of myocarditis also report troponin increase and chest pain. So myocarditis may be asymptomatic as re gards chest pain – and not everyone who has myocarditis therefore carries out a troponin test. Given the possible asympt omatic nature of this condition, it is therefore recommended that every vaccinated person has a troponin test.

2. Frequency of Symptoms:

High on the frequency list were pain, fever, headache and nausea – these were not localised to the injection site, but see med systemic.

Worryingly, arthralgia also occurred with very high frequency - suggesting the possibility of an auto-immune attack agains t joints. COVID-19 also occurred with very high frequency – and it would therefore be an error to call these "break-through cases", since they are a primary symptom of the vaccine rather than an occasional or rare one.

Chills	42071
Arthralgia	31523
Dizziness	25467
COVID-19	19564
Fatigue	18771

Top 5 symptoms for "Symptom 1"

Repeating the analysis with different parameters

The following parameters were used

```
association_rules = apriori(baskets, min_support=0.0001, min_confidence=0.2, min_lift=2, min_length=2) association_results = list(association_rules)
```

Results

1. Association Rules:

I had simply lowered the support parameter to 0.0001 so as to pick up rarer events. This resulted in the generation of 3542 association rules. The CSV is available here – https://howbad.info/sym3.csv

The Association Rules applying to exposure to the vaccine during pregnancy are shown below —

Sym 1	Sym 2	٠	Support 🕆	Confid	Lift 🔻
Exposure during pregnancy	Delivery		0.000133	0.808081	185.4105
Exposure during pregnancy	Foetal death		0.00011	0.785714	180.2786
Exposure during pregnancy	Caesarean section		0.000108	0.747126	171.4248
Maternal exposure during pregnancy	Glucose tolerance test		0.000113	0.660194	425.9317
Exposure during pregnancy	Abortion spontaneous		0.000878	0.557672	127.9553
Maternal exposure during pregnancy	Pregnancy test		0.000467	0.301075	367.9128

This indicates that in the reported incidents of adverse events, there is high confidence of foetal death (78%) and spontan eous abortion (56%) following exposure to the vaccine during pregnancy.

It follows that mothers should avoid any vaccination for COVID-19 during pregnancy, and avoid any vaccination before conception if they wish to protect the child.

2. Frequency of Symptoms:

Here are the 30 most common symptoms following COVID-19 Vaccination based on a pool of 600,000 records.

```
[('Headache', 91057),
('Fatigue', 79010),
('Chills', 74749),
('Dizziness', 56591),
('Pain', 48486),
('Pyrexia', 46911),
('Pain in extremity', 38103),
('Nausea', 37064),
('Arthralgia', 35154),
 ('Dyspnoea', 28452),
('Injection site pain', 28048),
('COVID-19', 25291),
('Myalgia', 24284),
 ('Rash', 24027),
 ('Asthenia', 23939),
('Pruritus', 22715),
('Injection site erythema', 22205),
('Erythema', 18489),
('Diarrhoea', 18161),
 ('Chest pain', 16923),
 ('Injection site swelling', 15926),
('Cough', 15712),
('Feeling abnormal', 15350),
('Injection site pruritus', 14971),
 ('Hyperhidrosis', 14684),
 ('Hypoaesthesia', 14602),
 ('Lymphadenopathy', 14111),
('SARS-CoV-2 test positive', 12719),
('Blood test', 12620),
 ('Urticaria', 12585)]
```

```
Pain in extremities is associated with thromb osis and clotting % \left( 1\right) =\left( 1\right) \left( 1\right)
```

Arthralgia is a symptom of arthritis suggesti ng a potential auto-immune effect

Covid-19 is a prominent symptom suggesting the inefficacy of the vaccine

Rash is a symptom associated with Herpes Zost er, that occurred with high frequency in Pfiz ers own study.

Chest Pain is associated with myocarditis and cardiac arrest $% \left(1\right) =\left(1\right) \left(1\right)$

Hypoaesthesia is numbness, especially in the extremities - associated with blood loss caus ed by micro-clotting